In This Issue

Preface ............................................................................................................................... 2
News & Notes ................................................................................................................... 3
Call for Papers ................................................................................................................ 5
Polanyi Studies In Hungary ............................................................................................. 6
   Walter B. Gulick
Materials from Polanyiana ............................................................................................. 9

Epistemology and the Human Sciences:
Michael Polanyi’s Contribution to the Reshaping of Moral Theology .............................. 11
   Terence Kennedy C.Ss.R.

Learning to Learn: Educating with/for the Mind-Body .................................................... 17
   Jerry H. Gill

Contributors ................................................................................................................... 27

On Mind and Meaning .................................................................................................... 28
   Robert P. Doede

Book Reviews ................................................................................................................ 43

Submissions for Publication .......................................................................................... 46

Information on Electronic Discussion Group ............................................................... 46

Membership Information ............................................................................................. 47
Preface

I am pleased to include in this issue a short article by Walter Gulick, a recent Fulbright Lecturer in Budapest who worked closely with members of the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association during his tenure in Hungary. Gulick provides helpful information about the MPLPA and interest in Polanyi in Hungary. There is as well material describing the most recent issue or TAD's sister journal, Polanyiana, which is an MPLPA project. Terence Kennedy's article explores affinities between Polanyi's thought and that of the Roman Catholic moral theologian Bernard Haring. Jerry Gill's reflections speak about teaching and learning. Gill was a recent participant in the conversations with William Poteat (a masterful teacher who explored Polanyi's ideas with Gill and many generations of students) sponsored by The Polanyi Society in Washington last November. Robert Doede's paper was originally given at 1992 gathering of The Polanyi Society. It is a careful philosophical essay which sets forth the concept of mind in Jerry Fodor's cognitive science and compares this perspective with Polanyi's richer ideas about body, meaning and mind.

After an interesting pair of meetings this year focusing upon William Poteat, The Polanyi Society annual meeting (held in conjunction with the annual meeting of the American Academy of Religion/Society of Biblical Literature) will revert to its earlier format: see David Rutledge's call for papers (p. 5) which carries a March deadline. The electronic discussion list on Polanyi's thought (p. 46) continues to gain subscribers. Unlike some lists, it is not the annoying type that inundates you with mail; in fact, it is so quiet, some of us will be soon writing in to stimulate a bit of discussion. Plug in, if you like.

Phil Mullins
The Polanyi Society meeting at the American Academy of Religion in Washington, D.C., Nov. 19 and 20 featured dialogue with William H. Poteat whose teaching and writing have probed many areas in common with those of Michael Polanyi. The sessions were remarkable for their sustained discussion of Poteat’s thought and gave everyone present a special opportunity to understand better Poteat’s appreciation of Polanyi and also Poteat’s sense of his own difference from Polanyi. Poteat stated that he regarded his own work as more radical than Polanyi’s. Poteat compared his way of changing our way of thinking to the Copernican revolution and asserted this through his thorough discussion of his overcoming the Cartesian dichotomy by his “mindbody” theme. The Friday evening session, presided over by Ron Hall, pursued mainly understanding Poteat’s thought. The Saturday morning session, presided over by Charles McCoy, pursued comparisons and contrasts with Polanyi. The content of these sessions is much too rich and subtle to be reduced to summary. Audio tapes are available for $7.00 from David Rutledge (Religion Department, Furman University, Greenville, SC 29613). There also may be a transcript made of these sessions. For further information, please contact David Rutledge. As one of those who have profited greatly by Poteat’s writing, his interests in Polanyi and the effect of his excellent teaching on many of our associates in The Polanyi Society, I was helpfully informed and strongly impressed as he led us in discussing his work. Many of us could see why Poteat is regarded as a great teacher and thinker and deserving of the loyalty and admiration of his former students.

A timely publication for this event was a volume of articles and essays edited by James Nickell and James W. Stines, The Primacy of Persons and the Language of Culture: Essays by William H. Poteat. While this volume will be reviewed in TAD, I recommend your ordering it from the University of Missouri Press, Columbia, Missouri.

This Polanyi Society meeting at the AAR brought together the most persons at an AAR meeting since our originating meeting with T. F. Torrance at the AAR in Chicago in 1975. Approximately 40 persons attended the Friday evening session and 30 attended the Saturday morning session. It was good to see some stalwart members like Jerry Gill and Gene Reeves again. Gene is still teaching in Japan, and Jerry Gill is at the College of St. Rose in Albany, New York.

The publications line in our renewal subscription form is producing more news of relevant publications and papers by our members. Below is a list compiled from recent receipts. If I have missed someone, please let me know.

Barbara D. Baumgarten completed in 1992 her Ph.D. at the Graduate Theological Union with a dissertation on Visual Art as Theology: A Post-critical Aesthetic for Theology Based on the Epistemology of Michael Polanyi. She also presented last March at the Western Region of the AAR “Contemplation and Artistic Expression: Some Reflections Based on the Epistemology of Michael Polanyi.”

Harvey Birenbaum, in literature at San Jose State University, has done a comparison of Nietzsche and Blake: Between Blake and Nietzsche: The Reality of Culture, Bucknell University Press, 1992 (available through Associated University Presses, 440 Forsgate Drive, Cranbury, NJ 08512). Birenbaum “argues that structuralism and poststructuralism have both left us, unnecessarily, with a highly attenuated view of what
culture is, how it operates, and how it relates to the personal existence of human beings.” The book also includes “an epistemological view of myth that accounts for the creative ambiguity of cultural reality.”


Walter B. Mead’s article on “John H. Hallowell: A Political Philosopher’s Critique of His Profession’s Paradigm,” The Political Science Review, 1993 provides insight into one of the Duke University professors who introduced graduate students to Polanyi.


Arthur S. Reber, one of the plenary speakers at the Kent State Centennial, has continued his application of Polanyian ideas as can be seen in his new book published by Oxford University Press: Implicit Learning and Tacit Knowledge, An Essay on the Cognitive Unconscious, New York, 1993.

A special issue of the philosophical journal The Personalist Forum is devoted to Michael Polanyi’s thought, and will appear early in 1994. The issue will contain two different articles on Polanyi and Kant by Ronald Hall and by Walter Gulick, and an article by Phil Mullins sketching a narrative of the self based on Polanyian themes. In addition, reviews of Ron Hall’s book Word and Spirit (by Jim Edwards), of William Poteat’s Philosophical Daybook (by Jim Stines), and of Robert Pirsig’s novel Lila (by Richard Gelwick) show how fertile Polanyi’s perspective has been for other thinkers. David Rutledge edited the issue; it is published by Mercer University Press, and is available for $5.00 from Thomas O. Buford, Department of Philosophy, Furman University, Greenville, SC 29613.
The Polanyi Society

Call For Papers

As in previous years, The Polanyi Society is planning to hold a meeting in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion/Society of Biblical Literature annual meeting, which will be held November 19-22, 1994 in Chicago, IL. The Society will follow its recent pattern of asking to be scheduled just prior to the opening of the annual meeting; as the AAR/SBL is considering beginning their sessions on Saturday morning, we may be scheduled for Friday evening, November 18th. We should have that information later this year.

If you are interested in presenting a paper at this session, please submit to David Rutledge by Friday, March 11, 1994, a proposal of approximately 300 words, on a plain sheet without identification. If there are several proposals forthcoming, a jury of Society members will be convened to do a blind reading of the candidates. We are planning for an hour and a quarter discussion of each of two papers, which will be distributed prior to the meeting. Paper titles, authors, and respondents will be listed in the AAR/SBL Program in the Additional Meetings section. We encourage papers on any topic related--directly or indirectly--to the thought of Michael Polanyi or his concerns.

David Rutledge
Coordinator for Religious Studies
The Polanyi Society
(803-294-3296)

Mailing Address: Department of Religion
Furman University
Greenville, SC 29613
POLANYI STUDIES IN HUNGARY

Walter B. Gulick

Last year I had the great good fortune to be appointed a Fulbright Scholar to teach at the Technical University of Budapest. On January 26, 1993, my wife and I were met at the Budapest airport by Gabriella Ujlaki, and then began perhaps the richest six months of my life. My official duties were not too complicated: to teach a course in Business Ethics at Technical University and a course in Contemporary American Philosophy at Eotvos Lorand University, also in Budapest. These official duties, it soon turned out, were but the appetizers for a delectable dinner of Hungarian culture, a many course meal we enjoyed in the company of some wonderful people.

However, my purpose in this article is not to recount the splendors of our experience, but to speak of a sister organization, the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association, and the state of Polanyian studies today in Hungary. Since its founding in Budapest in 1990, the MPLPA has compiled an impressive number of accomplishments. I’ll speak of some of these achievements in the context of an account of recent developments in Hungarian philosophy and culture.

When the Hungarian communist government collapsed in 1989, little was known in Hungary about the ideas of Michael Polanyi. His strong support of economic, political and cultural freedom made his thought unacceptable in official circles. After all, he played a leading role in the Congress for Cultural Freedom, a group firmly opposed to communism. While much Western writing was smuggled into Hungary during the communist era, I don’t believe any special attention was paid to Polanyi’s thought. Rather the importance of the ideas of Polanyi, a native born son, is still in the process of becoming recognized by Hungarians.

In bringing about this recognition, the MPLPA is having by far the largest impact. Perhaps its greatest contribution has been in making Polanyi’s work available in Hungarian translation. The Atlantisz Publishing House published Michael Polanyi’s Selected Philosophical Writings in 1992, a collection edited by Endre Nagy and Gabriella Ujlaki. Included in this collection are many articles from Knowing and Being. Two issues of Polanyiana, the MPLPA sponsored journal, also contain translations of Polanyi’s articles. Any time now Personal Knowledge will be published in a translation by Maria Pap and Gyorgy Petri. The Study of Man and The Tacit Dimension, already translated, await final revisions. Soon Science, Faith and Society will be translated. I find it remarkable that so much has been accomplished in four years.

Polanyiana is vital to the assimilation and critique of Polanyi among Hungarian academics. The plan is that two English language and two Hungarian issues will be published each year, although that appears to me to be ambitious given the relatively few number of Polanyi scholars in Hungary. In any case, the availability of Polanyiana offers those of us writing in English a great opportunity. Its format can accommodate longer, more developed articles than can usually be handled by Tradition and Discovery. I was pleased to be able to be helpful by serving as English language editor for a double issue of Polanyiana. Information about how to subscribe to and submit articles to Polanyiana can be found elsewhere in this issue of Tradition and Discovery.
The MPLPA has been working to ensure that there are resources available in Hungary to support further Polanyi scholarship. Endre Nagy and Gabriella Ujlaki have made two trips to the Joseph Regenstein Library at the University of Chicago in order to microfilm the most important of the Polanyi papers housed there. Last spring 44 microfilms of these papers arrived in Hungary and are now stored at the Library of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. Cataloguing their contents is now in progress. In addition, Eva Gabor and Gabor Pallo have found and brought home Polanyi’s letters and manuscripts from such places as Manchester, Oxford and Berlin.

An ultimate aim motivating the MPLPA’s activity is to found the Polanyi Archives as a research center for the study of the thought of Polanyi and other members of the tradition of philosophical liberalism in Central Europe. A number of personal items, already gathered, will be included in these archives. Letters by members of the Polanyi family have already been assembled by Erzsebet Vezer, as have some photos. The Archives will also contain books, articles, and documents dealing with the Polanyis. This very article will no doubt soon be nested there.

The MPLPA has already sponsored a number of conferences and lectures dealing with Polanyi. Richard Gelwick reported on the Polanyi Centennial Commemorative Conference held in Budapest August 24-26, 1991; see Tradition and Discovery XVII:3 (1991). As a new initiative, the MPLPA has announced a competition for young writers.

All that the MPLPA has accomplished would not have been possible without the aid of considerable financial support. The Soros Foundation has been especially generous in its support of the Association’s activities. As is true of the other Eastern European countries, Hungary is still seeking to find a secure place in the global economy, and the transition is not easy. The real income of professors is declining, and I can assure you academic salaries would by themselves not allow for the traveling Hungarian Polanyians have been able to do. Eventually the work of the MPLPA will have to be self supporting, but for now the assistance of the Soros Foundation, Central European University and other groups has been indispensable.

In one major respect the intentions of the MPLPA are unlike those of The Polanyi Society in North America. As has been already suggested, the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association has as its aim an investigation of “the philosophical, historical, sociological, psychological roots and results of the tradition of Central European liberal thought” (Polanyiana 2:3, p. 63). This means the group is interested in the thought of Karl as well as Michael Polanyi — and in such thinkers as Mannheim, Popper, Hayek, Koestler, Lakatos, and even Wittgenstein. Lee Congdon’s book, Exile and Social Thought: Hungarian Intellectuals In Germany and Austria 1891-1933 (Princeton University Press) provides a most helpful background for understanding this Central European tradition of liberal thought. To date, however, the broad interest of the MPLPA has remained latent and almost exclusive attention has been devoted to Michael Polanyi.

Eva Gabor writes about the “liberal” in the association’s title in these terms:

At the very first meeting, we had a debate about the word “liberal” occurring in the name of the Society. There were fears that perhaps some would misunderstand the meaning of this word. We do not want to lay emphasis on its political connotation; only the philosophical implications are important for us. We consider ourselves to be a Society of open minded, liberal-oriented thinkers.
This was the leading idea of Michael Polanyi in all his life and work (*Polanyiana* 2:1,2, p. 12).

Endre Nagy’s arguments were especially pursuasive in convincing the new society to include the word “liberal” in its title. His article in the current issue of *Polanyiana*, “Civil Society in Michael Polanyi’s Thought,” is most helpful in indicating how Polanyi’s social thought is relevant to Hungary’s developing economic, civic and political structures.

It is hard for us in the West to imagine the emotion connected to the word “liberal” in Hungarian society. On this word pivots the whole contrast between a controlled and a free society. As Nagy makes clear, Hungarians did not revolt against communism primarily for economic reasons. Actually, Hungary’s economy was one of the healthiest in the eastern bloc; it profited greatly from trade with the old USSR. No, Hungarians turned from communism primarily because the freedom to speak, travel and organize was impeded. The threats to liberty — to liberalism — were often subtle, but they were definitely felt.

Today, after four years of attempts to make the Hungarian economy more efficient so it can compete effectively in the global economy, the word “liberal” retains its power to attract an emotional response. Unemployment, previously unknown in communist society, has hit many workers — about 15% of the Hungarian work force at present. Real wages have declined for most who retain their jobs. Political apathy is rampant. Joining the European Community is the great hope motivating most intellectuals, but that still seems far off in an insecure future. While very few want to return to communism, disaffection among Hungarians is increasingly common now, and one target of the disaffected is those who avow any form of liberalism. That may be why the plaque on the Budapest birthplace of Michael Polanyi was recently smashed. Quite possibly it was destroyed because it announces it was sponsored by the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association; Eva Gabor’s fear that “liberal” would be misunderstood in a political sense may have proved prophetic. (Or was it destroyed because the Polanyis were Jewish? Probably not.)

These are difficult times of transition in Hungary, and my hope is that Western nations will work diligently to lower tariffs and trade barriers so that the European Community can embrace Hungary as soon as possible. Certainly I would not want to leave any reader with the impression that Hungarians are inhospitable or the country dangerous. My wife traveled on the excellent public transportation of Budapest after dark with a sense of security, a sense she would not feel at night in many of our large cities. My hosts at the Technical University, Marta Feher, Eva Gabor, and Gabriella Ujlaki, all key members of the MPLPA (we called them “our three angels”), were exquisitely generous and helpful. We immersed ourselves in Hungarian culture and returned refreshed and enlivened. The liberal spirit of Polanyi is indeed alive in Hungary, and so is the hospitality and intellectual ferment which once graced the salon of Cecile Mama.
Materials from Polanyiana

Editor’s Note: The preceding article by Walter Gulick discusses the work of The Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association (MPLPA) in Hungary; Gulick describes his Spring Semester 1993 term in Budapest as a Fulbright Scholar where he worked with MPLPA in putting together an English language double issue of Polanyiana, the periodical of MPLPA. The short article below is Gabriella Ujlaki’s "Introduction" to this double issue in which she reviews other articles included in the issue. If you wish to order a copy of Polanyiana 2:4 and 3:1, you should send a check for $10 (or equivalent) airmail to Magyar Hitel Bank, Budapest 1122, Pozsonyi ut 77-79, HUNGARY. Make the check to MPLPA and indicate the account number is 2221004351. You must also send notification to Dr. Eva Gabor (President of MPLPA, Technical University of Budapest, Department of Philosophy, 1111 Budapest, Muegyetem rkp. K. I. 59, HUNGARY) that you want a copy of Polanyiana 2:4 and 3:1 and have forwarded a check to Magyar Hitel Bank. Include a xerox copy of the check.

Introduction

The present double issue of Polanyiana contains articles by researchers who make use of Michael Polanyi’s thought. There are among the authors philosophers, theologians and psychologists. Our aim in presenting this collection of essays is twofold. First, our intention is to make available to a broader audience some of the articles which were presented on different occasions (conferences, seminars) when Michael Polanyi’s work was discussed. We feel it is our task to select and publish the best of them. And our second purpose in this double issue is to give an opportunity to the interested reader to grasp the richness of the way of developing Polanyi’s ideas as a basis for further thought.

Among the contributions, there are papers by philosophers of different branches of the discipline. Walter Gulick’s paper, “Polanyi’s Theory of Meaning: Exposition, Elaboration, and Reconstruction,” is a very detailed and scholarly reconsideration of Polanyi’s thoughts on linguistic, artistic and religious meaning. It is based on his original insights concerning how to improve Polanyi’s ideas in psychology, philosophy and aesthetics. Polanyi’s last work, Meaning, written together with Harry Prosch, is taken as the major point of departure. Gulick’s article offers a new approach to the topic and challenges the reader to think further about the nature of meaning and how it is constructed.

Marjorie Grene’s article, “The Subjective and the Personal,” is a detailed analysis of two key concepts, indicated in her title, of Polanyi’s philosophy in Personal Knowledge. The article was one of the main presentations at the centennial conference of Michael Polanyi at Kent State University in 1991. The author, an eminent philosopher who was assistant to Michael Polanyi and his closest friend and colleague at the time of writing Personal Knowledge, offered the manuscript to our Association to be published in Polanyiana. We appreciate her kindness very much, and we are honored by being able to publish it first.

Aaron Milavec’s article, “If I Join Forces with Mr. Kuhn,” represents another main branch of philosophy which is very much impacted by Polanyi’s thought, namely philosophy of science. The article was also presented at Kent State and it helps the reader to understand how great Polanyi’s role was in formulating Kuhn’s seminal book on scientific revolutions.
Phil Mullins’ article, “Religious Meaning in Polanyi’s *Personal Knowledge,*” provides a step toward clarifying the extent to which Polanyi’s views about religion changed by the time of *Meaning,* the subject of much debate. Mullins, General Editor of *Tradition and Discovery,* writes down Polanyi’s ideas about religion as presented in *Personal Knowledge.* Its approach is that of the philosopher of religion rather than of the theologian, so it helps the reader to get a clearer impression about his discipline, unfortunately almost neglected in Hungary.

Joan Crewdson’s contribution to our double issue is a chapter of her still unpublished book on Polanyi’s relevance to theology. We have chosen a chapter which might have relevance both for philosophers and theologians. This article represents the theological reception of Polanyi’s work in our issue. The author shows how Polanyi’s triadic structure of meaning can be interpreted as illuminating the theological doctrines of the Trinity in general and the Holy Spirit in particular. This article demonstrates one direction that a theology inspired by Polanyi’s thought might take.

Arthur S. Reber’s presentation was among the major addresses given at Kent State. Reber gives us evidence about the relevance of Polanyi’s views on tacit knowledge to current psychological research. He indicates that Polanyi was able to anticipate much that is now supported by empirical evidence.

Csaba Pleh is one of Hungary’s leading psychologists. His article provides a comprehensive survey of psychological thought during the last thirty years. His emphasis is on how the computer has provided an inspiration for studies of cognition, but how it has also created problems to which Polanyi was sensitive.

An earlier version of Endre J. Nagy’s paper was given also at Kent State and it represents an approach of a sociologist and lawyer to Polanyi’s ideas. Polanyi’s liberal conservatism is almost unknown in Hungary, but it provides very much needed support for the creation of a new social system here. The importance of this aspect of Polanyi’s thought inspired the Association to call itself the Michael Polanyi Liberal Philosophical Association. Endre J. Nagy, an organizing member of the Association, addresses in his article the present Hungarian situation and explains how Polanyi’s thought about civil society can be of assistance now.

The present double issue of *Polanyiana* could not have been published without the much appreciated work of Walter Gulick who has been a Fulbright visiting professor in the Philosophy Department of Budapest Technical University this spring, who is also a representative of the North American Polanyi Society. We are very grateful for his help in editing and for his paper written for this issue of *Polanyiana.*

Gabriella Ujlaki

*Polanyiana,* Vol 2, No. 4 1993 Vol 3, No 1 1993

June, 1993