

Tradition & Discovery

The Polanyi Society Periodical

Volume XXXVI

Number 2

2009--2010

Preface.....	2
News and Notes.....	3
Tradition in a Free Society: The Fideism of Michael Polanyi and the Rationalism of Karl Popper.....	8
Struan Jacobs	
Embodied Knowing: The Tacit Dimension in Johnson and Lakoff, and Merleau-Ponty.....	26
Kyle Takaki	
Notes on Contributors.....	39
William H. Poteat: An Oblique Introduction.....	40
Phil Mullins	
But Bill . . . ?: Poteatian Meditations.....	43
R. Melvin Keiser	
William H. Poteat and the Convertibility of Logic and Love.....	50
Elizabeth Newman	
Information on Polanyi Society Electronic Discussion List.....	53
Bill Poteat's Post-Critical Logic and the Origins of Modernity.....	54
Murray Jardine	
“Thanks For Everything, Poteat!”: An Intellectual (But Personal) Autobiography.....	59
Araminta Stone Johnston	
WWW Polanyi Resources.....	63
Poteat Changed My Life.....	64
John Berkman	
Submissions for Publication.....	66
Wisdom as Seen Through Scientific Lenses: A Selective Survey of Research in Psychology and the Neurosciences.....	67
Paul Lewis	
Polanyi's Epistemology in the Light of Neuroscience--A Review Article.....	73
Walter Gulick	
Reviews	83
Simen Andersen Øyen and Rasmus T. Slaattelid, eds., <i>Multiple Democracies in Theory and History</i> Walter Gulick	
Andy Clark. <i>Supersizing the Mind: Embodiment, Action, and Cognitive Extension</i> Paul Lewis	

The Polanyi Society

General Editor-Tradition & Discovery

Phil Mullins
Missouri Western State University
St. Joseph, MO 64507
(816)244-2612 FAX (816)271-5987
mullins@missouriwestern.edu

David Rutledge, Board President

Department of Religion
Furman University
Greenville, SC 29613-6298
David.Rutledge@furman.edu

Dale Cannon, Board Secretary

Division of Humanities
Western Oregon University
Monmouth, OR 97361 USA
cannodw@wou.edu

Jere Moorman, Board Treasurer

1020 Partrick Road
Napa, CA 94558
JEREMOOR@aol.com

Charles Lowney
Department of Philosophy
Washington and Lee University
Lexington, VA 24450
lowneyc@wlu.edu

Walter Mead
4 Kenyon Court
Bloomington, IL 61701-3320
wbmead@comcast.net

Esther Meek
Geneva College
Beaver Falls, PA 15010
longingtoknow@gmail.com

Phil Rolnick
University of St. Thomas
2115 Summit Avenue
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55105
PAROLNICK@stthomas.edu

ZhenhuaYu
Department of Philosophy
East China Normal University
3663 North Zhongshan Rd.
Shanghai 200062, China
ecnyu@hotmail.com

Tony Clark
Department of Religion and Humanities
Friends University
2100 W. University St.
Wichita, KS 67213
clarkto@friends.edu

Diane Yeager
Theology Department
Georgetown University
37th and O Streets, NW
Washington, DC 20057
yeagerd@georgetown.edu

Associate Editor/Board Vice President

Paul Lewis
Mercer University
Macon, GA 31207
(478) 301-4166
lewis_pa@mercer.edu

Book Review Editor

Walter Gulick
Montana State University--Billings
Billings, MT 59101
(406) 259-3622
WGulick@msubillings.edu

Preface

Struan Jacobs' essay herein compares Popper and Polanyi, a topic touched in some earlier essays, but Jacobs' discussion is an impressively thorough one. Kyle Takaki, a new *TAD* author, also interestingly puts Polanyi together with Johnson and Lakoff and Merleau-Ponty in this issue.

For the third time, *TAD* is featuring reflections by former students on William H. Poteat, a figure who early discovered and taught the post-critical thought of Michael Polanyi and who inspired generations of Duke students to consider the contradictions of modernity. The panel on Poteat at the 2008 Loyola Polanyi conference was the source of the recent set of reflections in 35:2. Mel Keiser, one of Poteat's early students, did not make the conference but was inspired by the *TAD* essays and carefully formulated his own response to Poteat; the essays by Elizabeth Newman, Murray Jardine, Araminta Stone Johnston and John Berkmann are those of Poteat's last students, a group under-represented in previous discussions of Poteat.

Paul Lewis and Walter Gulick have provided review articles covering some recent scientific literature that can be linked to Polanyi's ideas and Polyanian projects. Gulick has also written a review of a new and interesting book that grew out of the recent "multiple democracies" conference sponsored by the University of Bergen in Norway and Shanghai's East China Normal University. Lewis also reviews a book on "extended mind," a topic now popular in philosophy of mind.

Take a close look at what is in "News and Notes." Especially important is the call for graduate student papers to be featured at the late October 2010 Polanyi Society annual meeting (see p. 3). Also you will find a note about dues payment, a call for donations to the Travel Fund and the Society's financial records and minutes from the November annual meeting.

Phil Mullins

Tradition and Discovery is indexed selectively in *The Philosopher's Index* and *Religious and Theological Abstracts* and is included in the EBSCO online database of academic and research journals.

NEWS AND NOTES

Invitation to Graduate Students To Submit Papers For Polanyi Society Annual Meeting October 30, 2010

At the 2010 Polanyi Society annual meeting (to be held in conjunction with the American Academy of Religion annual meeting) both paper sessions will be devoted to the work of current or very recent graduate students who have an interest in Polanyi. Sessions are tentatively scheduled for Saturday, October 30, from 9:00 to 11:30 a.m. with a second session following on Saturday evening (probably 7-9:30 p.m.). Locations and times for sessions will be finalized later in the year and will be included in a later issue of *TAD*; they will be also be posted on the Polanyi Society web site as well as the web site used for the AAR Additional Meetings schedule.

Three papers will be presented in each session. Each paper is to be no more than six double-spaced pages, giving a maximum reading time of 20 minutes per paper. Participants who wish to expand their presentation papers into a longer format will be given priority consideration for publication in *Tradition and Discovery: The Polanyi Society Periodical*.

Graduate students are invited to submit a 300- to 1000-word proposal by March 1, 2010, the regular AAR conference submission deadline. Proposals that focus on some aspect of Polanyi-related research or that use Polanyi en route to developing an issue will be considered. Topics can be on any of the many areas that interested Michael Polanyi, such as: epistemology, metaphysics, theology and science, philosophy of science, culture, economics, sociology, and political philosophy.

If you have or know a talented graduate student(s) who is unfamiliar with Polanyi's work but might find it useful, please encourage the student to read Polanyi and submit a proposal. Prior expertise on Polanyi is not expected, only current interest. The Society also hopes to provide some modest travel funds for students presenting at the Atlanta meeting.

Questions and submissions can be directed to Neil Arner (neil.arners@yale.edu or 203-468-6824), a graduate student at Yale who is coordinating the program.

A Note on Dues Payment

Please notice that this is a *TAD* issue with an enclosed self-addressed envelope to be used to pay 2009-2010 academic year membership dues IF YOU HAVENOT ALREADY DONE SO. Because of postage regulations, EVERY copy (even if you have already paid dues) must weigh the same and therefore must include an envelope. An envelope also was included in the October, 2009 issue. If you cannot recall if you have already paid, e-mail an inquiry to Phil Mullins. Dues remain \$35 (\$25 for libraries and \$15 students), a true bargain in the academic journal world.

Many have generously included with dues payment a tax deductible contribution to the Society; these dollars go to promote things such as our new Speakers' Bureau and the Travel Fund which will be seriously tapped to help defray travel for the 2010 annual meeting featuring graduate students. See the discussion of both the Speakers' Bureau and the Travel Fund below.

If you do not wish to mail dues in the self-addressed envelope, you can also still simply send an e-mail to Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu) with credit card information and authorization to debit your account. With luck, there will soon be available a dues payment form on the Polanyi Society web site that you can complete on-line and e-mail to Mullins.

The Travel Fund and 2010, “The Year of the Young Scholar”

Walter Mead

Members and friends of the Polanyi Society have always been quick and generous in responding to appeals to shore up the Society’s funds—whether the appeal has been for the general fund after a more-costly-than-anticipated conference, or for prepublication orders to encourage a publisher to re-issue an out-of-print book by Polanyi, or for rebuilding the Travel Fund to help young Polanyian scholars to attend our meetings.

The Society has always managed to meet its needs through a combination of frugal operations and the generosity of supporters. With a wish-list of new projects the Society would like to engage in—such things as a Speakers’ Bureau, expanded resources to encourage Polanyian scholarship, special collaborative programs to bring Polanyian perspectives into dialogue with such correlative interests as those represented by phenomenologists, gestalt psychologists, quantum theorists, etc.—we are hoping to establish for the Society a more substantial financial base less reliant on ad hoc appeals by exploring the potential for foundational support, individual estate planning, perhaps even the possibility of establishing sufficient funding for an endowment.

Meanwhile, I must once again make an ad hoc appeal for contributions to our Travel Fund, established only a few years ago to provide travel subsidies for young Polanyian scholars who otherwise would find it difficult to attend our programs. Because of the exceptional travel costs, as well as — for some — the cost of obtaining a passport, incurred by those traveling from the U.S. to our 2009 annual meeting in Montreal, and also because members had recently contributed generously to other Society projects, I did not anticipate that the Society would be able to provide much help for travel assistance to our Montreal meeting and, therefore, did not strongly urge contributions to the

Travel Fund in 2009.

Our Travel Fund, as a result, began the year at barely over \$400 and at the end of the year stood at about the same amount. This new year 2010, however, is a different year. For the first time in the Society’s history, we are making multiple and concerted efforts to attract and encourage young Polanyian scholars by structuring the program of our annual meeting, in October 2010, around their scholarship and involvement, as presenters and discussants.

Also, a subsequent issue of *TAD* will feature qualifying essays authored by young scholars. In China, 2010 has been designated “The Year of the Tiger.” I suggest that, for the Polanyi Society, this year might properly be regarded as “The Year of the Young Scholar.” If we succeed in truly carrying out this effort in 2010, the fruits of our efforts will be apparent in an even more flourishing body of Polanyian-related scholarship in 2020 and 2030.

For our meetings in the continental U.S., we have been able to make travel possible for young scholars with an average grant of about \$300. Given increased flight costs, to be able to address the anticipated needs of six young scholars, we hope to be able to build our travel fund to \$2,000. ***An anonymous donor, enthused about our focus this year on young scholars, has offered to match contributions of \$300 with a similar amount.*** However, smaller contributions will be just as gratefully received. Please excuse this request for contribution if it comes as an “overkill.” I have been advised that several members made generous contributions when paying 09-10 dues.

Because the Polanyi Society is registered as a non-profit organization, contributions are tax-deductible. Checks should be made out to the “Polanyi Society - Travel Fund” and mailed to **Walter Mead, 4 Kenyon Court, Bloomington, IL 61701**. For additional information, e-mail Mead (wbmead@comcast.net).

**Minutes of Combined Board and
Member Meeting of Polanyi Society
November 7, 2009
Montreal**

1. The meeting was called to order by Wally Mead, President. It was determined a quorum was present.

2. Reference was made to a two part China Report emailed to Board members by Walt Gulick and Phil Mullins. The fuller oral report was made the previous evening in a restaurant too noisy to conduct regular business. Zhenhua Yu is hoping to organize a conference in China in 2011 sponsored by the Center for Knowledge and Action; he is seeking funding for this effort. Zhenhua would like to invite other scholars in China who study Polanyi to participate. Insofar as it is appropriate, Gulick urged the Board to be supportive of such efforts.

3. Upon recommendation from the Nominating Committee, the following were unanimously re-elected to 3-year terms on the Board: Tony Clark, Esther Meek, Zhenhua Yu. Charles Lowney was elected to a 3 year term to succeed Marty Moleski, who completed his years of eligibility, serving well as secretary during those years.

4. Wally Mead asked to step down from his position as President to attend to other duties and interests he had put off during his three years in office. Walt Gulick noted a few of his many accomplishments, and the Board thanked him for his exceptional service. Mead thanked Board members for their support and for his opportunity to serve. Mead will continue to be the point person for seeking and dispersing travel funds for young scholars.

5. David Rutledge was elected to the Presidency and Dale Cannon was elected Secretary.

6. The outline for a Speakers' Bureau drafted by Mullins was discussed and approved with details to

be worked out. A committee of Mullins, Lewis, Gulick and Lowney will oversee the development of the bureau. Publicity about the program highlighting available presentations will be generated; colleges and universities likely to be interested will be targeted at first, and host schools would usually be expected to cover the costs of securing speakers.

7. The Treasurer's Report prepared by Jere Moorman was approved with the proviso that the approximately \$8,000 in the Scott Fund should be included in the report as a special fund or endowment. Richard Gelwick will be contacted to see if any of the Scott funds might be used in support of young scholars presenting next year in Atlanta. Mullins reported that \$2300 more was received in support of *TAD* than was spent this fiscal year, but that the Loyola Chicago conference did not quite break even.

8. Mead sent a letter of thanks to Missouri Western, when Mullins retired in May 2008, for its support of *TAD* and the Polanyi Society. That letter was made available to the Board.

9. Mullins noted that about 150 individuals and institutions are now receiving *TAD* electronically and about 300 individuals and institutions receive the paper version, including about 30 persons overseas, each issue of which costs \$4 to \$5 apiece to send. Those receiving only the electronic version do not receive the request for dues and the mailer. Mead said his 300 letters requesting dues payment netted little return, but at this point Mullins said that the stamped and pre-addressed envelopes recently included in *TAD* mailings are bringing faster renewals than usual, and that e-mail records are now improved. There were 80 persons (or institutions) who paid memberships and/or made donations in academic year 2008-2009, and this generated \$4475 as against *TAD* expenses of \$2130 (counting October, 2009). That is, the Polanyi Society is blessed with generous contributors who cover costs for our current level of operation.

10. Gulick reported that the Polanyi Reader will be sent to Oxford University Press once the bibli-

ography is tidied up; he will test the Reader in the spring when he teaches a course on Polanyi in Estonia.

11. Newly elected President Rutledge, noting tightened budgets for travel, asked whether it would be wise to schedule Polanyi Society meetings every other year. This was not deemed necessary, but it was thought that perhaps the Friday night time slot might be used for the Board meeting and the two paper sessions be scheduled on Saturday, since the AAR seemed open to such scheduling and attendance is weaker on Fridays.

12. Mead reported on a 3 day Liberty fund colloquium in Indianapolis during which he and Mark Mitchell spent considerable time discussing Polanyi's thought.

13. The possibility was raised of a future conference in New Haven celebrating the new Poteat Archives at Yale Divinity School that Mead has been helping establish.

14. Neil Arner was present to describe the Polanyi Society program for Atlanta in 2010 that he and Phil Rolnick have been arranging. They hope to recruit 4 to 6 undergraduates, graduate students, or recent graduates without regular academic positions to give brief papers (up to 6 pages) involving Polanyi's thought. At present the approach is to contact professors for their recommendations of promising candidates, but some sentiment was expressed to send out a public announcement of the opportunity in *TAD* or on the Polanyi Society Discussion List. It was suggested that young scholars might profitably be linked to mature Polanyi scholars who could serve as mentors.

15. During a discussion of ways of expanding Polanyi's impact and securing funding for such an effort, Diane Yeager noted that we could consider seeking an NEH Summer Seminar on Polanyi, but suggested that proposals had a much better chance to be funded if Polanyi was linked with more widely known figures like Merleau-Ponty, Peirce, Grene, etc. There is a certain amount of arbitrariness (or even neglect – note

our Koch grant application) in the evaluation of proposals for funding; it often appears that luck in drawing sympathetic or knowledgeable evaluators is the crucial factor in securing funding.

16. The meeting was adjourned at about 12:50 p.m.

Submitted by Walt Gulick, subbing for Martin Moleski

Polanyi Society: Treasurer's Report 9/1/08-8/31/09

Statement Balance (9-01-08)	9,424.91
Income:	
12-17 Membership, gifts	3,300
02-17 From Wally Mead:	1,664
(From Wally Mead: for TD purchase from U/Chicago press. See debit [04-02] below)	
02-28 Correction deposit (Dues)	160
04-15 Membership, gifts	2,000
Total income:	7,124
Expenses/Debits	
09-26 <i>TAD</i> 34:3 (09-08)	572.23
10-14 Transfer to CD (Scott)	7,885.59
(Interest of \$159.30 due to be posted on 09/14/09: not on this report)	
03-26 <i>TAD</i> (02-09)	1,505.57
04-02 <i>Tacit Dimension</i>	1,664.00
(To Wally Mead for purchase of <i>TD</i> from U/Chicago press (See income [02-17] above)	
05-22 AAR (2009)	240.00
06-08 Travel Fund	40.00
Total expenses and debits:	11,907.39

SUMMARY

A. Beginning Bal. checking	9,424.91
B. Income	7,124.00
C. Expenses and debits	11,907.39
08-31-09 Bal.	4,641.52
Post 08/31/08 Notes	
10-14-08 Scott 2% CD interest	159.30

Marjorie Grene Memorial and Memorial Fund

Last spring, there was a memorial event honoring Marjorie Grene at Virginia Tech. Many of her students, colleagues and family commented on Grene's life and work. A recording of the event is on the web, along with photographs at: <http://www.phil.vt.edu/people/memorial.html>. A memorial fund that will support things done in Grene's honor has been established. If you are interested in making a contribution, contact Jim Klagge (jklagge@vt.edu).

Yale Divinity School Collection Of William Poteat Papers

As noted in earlier issues of *TAD*, a collection of William Poteat's papers is being established at the Yale Divinity School Library. This project is now moving into its final stages. Soon Walter Mead will deliver materials to YDS. If you have not heard about this project and have materials that you think would be of value to this Poteat Collection, please inform Wally Mead (wbmead@comcast.net).

Appraisal

The October 2009 (v.7, n. 4) issue of *Appraisal: The Journal of the Society for Post-Critical Philosophy and Personalist Studies* was recently published. The following articles are in the issue: (1) **Wendy Hamblet**, "Jacques Rancière: The Philosopher and His Poor on the Shores of Democratic Politics"; (2) **Fauve Lybaert**, "Mental Causation and Explanatory Practice"; (3) **Ignacio Moya Arriagada**, "The Primacy of Space in Heidegger and Taylor: Towards A Unified Account of Personal Identity"; (4) **Gregory de Vleeschouwer**, "'Person' Seeks 'Man'"; (5) **Ivan Welty**, "Singularity and Personal Identity"; (6) **R. T. Allen**, "Raymond Tallis and the Alleged Necessity of a Body for Personal Identity." The last four of these essays were papers from the recently concluded Tenth International Conference on Persons.

The revamped *Appraisal* website at <http://www.spcps.org.uk/> has the table of contents of all issues going back to volume 1 in March 1996. You can order a CD with all back issues, volumes 1 through 6. Payments can now be made via the website, making things much easier for subscribers outside UK.

New Speakers' Bureau

The Polanyi Society Board recently appointed a committee to put together a Speakers' Bureau for the Society. Although planning is just beginning, if you are interested in finding a speaker, please contact Phil Mullins (mullins@missouriwestern.edu /816-244-2612). Topics for talks can be general (e.g., Polanyi's account of science) or more specific (e.g., Polanyi on truth and propaganda) and perhaps can be negotiated. Eventually, information about Speakers' Bureau programming will be posted on the Polanyi Society web site.